Ocean Governance on Canada's West Coast

Victoria, BC – 8 June 2007 Lecture Notes

Applied Institutional Analysis: The Diagnostic Method As Applied to Ocean Governance Oran R. Young

Goal: Drawing on lessons from IDGEC as they relate to marine systems

IDGEC – Institutional Dimensions of Global Environmental Change

A core project of IHDP now in its synthesis phase

Focus on institutions as assemblages of rights, rules, and decisionmaking procedures and the social practices that grow up around them

Analysis of the roles that institutions play in causing and in addressing largescale environmental problems

Research foci: causality, performance, and design

The Appeal of Institutional Design to Both Practitioners and Analysts

- 1 We now live in a world of socio-ecological systems or humandominated ecosystems
 - o The need to endogenize human actions on a large scale
- 1 The need to govern or guide human actions is greater than ever before
 - o Steering collective behavior
- 2 The role of institutions as core elements of governance systems
 - o Institutions as sources of problems AND as solutions
- 3 The idea that institutions are socially constructed and therefore more malleable than others factors, such as PAT
 - o A cautionary note on institutional stickiness

Institutional diagnostics

The need to fit or match institutions to the character of the problems at hand

- 4 Issues vary; one size does not fit all
- 5 The devil is usually in the details
- 6 Need to design institutions on a case-by-case basis or in the light of major features of specific situations

The diagnostic method

- 7 The role of expertise
 - o Examples from engineering, architecture, agronomy as well as medicine
- 8 Diagnostic queries
 - o The idea of interrogating a situation in detail to make an accurate diagnosis
 - o Launching a sizable number of diagnostic queries or questions designed to help identify what is needed
- 9 The four P's in the case of applied institutional analysis
 - o Problems, Players, Practices, and Politics
 - o Provide some examples relevant to ocean governance

Problems

- 10 Is there consensus regarding the appropriate way to frame the issue for purposes of problem solving?
 - o What is to be maximized MSY, MEY, OY, some broader criterion of ecosystem services?
- 11 Is the problem simple or compound?
 - o Issue complexes; interacting issues
 - o Place-based vs. sectoral approaches many issues in one place vs. individual issues in many places
- 12 Does the problem involve complex systems characterized by non-linear dynamics?
 - o Role of initial conditions, thresholds and tipping points, abrupt changes, irreversibilities
 - o Early warning, quick reaction

Players

- 13 Does the problem involve different types of actors with distinct interests and behavioral characteristics?
 - o Coastal/port/flag states
 - o States vs. nonstate actors
- 14 Do the major players respond to the logic of consequences or the logic of appropriateness?
 - o Implications for compliance and enforcement
- 15 How large is the group of subjects likely to be, and how transparent is their behavior?
 - o Implications for monitoring
 - o Equipment standards vs. discharge standards

Practices

- 16 Are the parties free to design any type of agreement they prefer or must they operate within a broader constitutive structure?
 - o Relevance of UNCLOS as an overarching arrangement
- 17 Is the arrangement expected to operate as a stand alone system or can it be nested into a larger system for purposes of implementation?
 - o Example of MARPOL within IMO vs. ICRW on its own

Politics – power-interests-ideas

- 18 Is power/influence concentrated or disbursed among the players?
 - o Does the group constitute what is known as a privileged group?
- 19 Are there negotiating coalitions or blocs whose members can be counted on to stick together and to stick to commitments?
 - o Role of transactions costs UNCLOS example
- 20 Is there a dominant discourse that controls thinking about framing and solutions?
 - o Dueling discourses: EBM vs. MSY

Concluding remark

Windows of opportunity and the importance of advance preparations

- 21 Constitutive moments
- 22 The case for being well-prepared when they occur